

vaiparaiso University Interlibrary



ILLiad TN: 56045

**Borrower:** SWW

**Lending String:** \*IVU,GPM,KRS,FTU,CKK

**Patron:** Koster, Jo

**Journal Title:** The Sixteenth century journal.

**Volume:** 38 **Issue:** 3

**Month/Year:** 2007**Pages:** 908-910

**Article Author:**

**Article Title:** Josephine A. Koster 'Review of William Baer, 'Luis De Camoes; Selected Sonnets''

**Imprint:** [Kirksville, Mo., etc., Sixteenth Centur

**ILL Number:** 39380930



**Call #:** D220 .S57 v.38 [2007]

**Location:** Christopher Ctr-  
Periodicals-1st FL LIB USE ONLY

**ARIEL**

**Charge**

**Maxcost:** \$25.00IFM

**Shipping Address:**

Interlibrary Lending Service

Dacus Library

Winthrop University

Rock Hill, SC 29733

**Fax:**

**Ariel:** 192.203.180.197

using real names and reconstructed, often politicized events, were fashionable in the mid-sixteenth century" (70). Refreshing for bibliographic enthusiasts, Finucci illustrates differences between the two manuscripts available for this work; the Piranesi version edits out erotic elements of the story.

The main event, the *Urania* itself, begins with the "Dedicatory Epistle to the Magnificent and Excellent Doctor of Law, Signor Bartolomeo Salvatico." Demonstrating many of the same rhetorical strategies used by both women's and men's dedicatory epistles, this preface goes a step farther by offering a Socratic-styled dialogue between the author and a pygmy named Giudizio.

The translation is lovely. Finucci depicts the fluency of the language through her diction and she even comments upon a few of her word choices. The notes, which appear at the foot of the page, dedicate considerable space to revealing the sources of Bigolina's plots. Most often noted are Boccaccio's *Fiametta* (1343–44) and *Decameron* (1351), and Ariosto's *Orlando Furioso* (1532); considerable indebtedness of Petrarch's sonnets to Laura and Castiglione's *Courtier* (1528) is also well noted. Giving specific citations when available, the editor sometimes retells parts of the tale or quotes directly from the source. The notes include everything from the derivation of names to the average dowry of a middle-class woman in Venice and Padua, to extensive lists of contemporary books and critical studies on a variety of relevant subjects. Finucci makes it worth the effort to look to the bottom of the page.

Finucci published an Italian edition of the *Urania* in 2002. With the publication of this edition in English, Bigolina can look forward to more critical attention by scholars internationally. And, perhaps more promising for her future, Bigolina, who was so adamant about the importance of education for women, can be studied in the classrooms from which she was barred. The smart girl gets the last laugh.



**Luís de Camões: Selected Sonnets.** Ed. and trans. William Baer. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2005. 199 pp. \$26.00. ISBN 978-0-226-09266-9.

REVIEWED BY: Josephine A. Koster, Winthrop University

Luís de Camões (1524–80), "the Portuguese Virgil," was one of the Renaissance's most important poets, not only for his Portuguese national epic *Os Lusíadas* but for an influential body of shorter poems, particularly sonnets, which were hailed by authors from Cervantes to Poe and Bishop (and which inspired Elizabeth Barrett Browning's famous title *Sonnets from the Portuguese*). Sadly, modern scholars have had to approach Camões through a turgid Victorian translation by Sir Richard Burton published in 1884. It is far past time, as Helen Vendler has argued, for "a new translation into English—even if into English prose—of Camões's sonnets, to replace the fustian of the Burton version, which altogether fails to convey Camões's lofty plainness and painful sobriety." ("Camoës the Sonneteer." *Portuguese Literary and Cultural Studies* 9 [Fall 2002]: 17–37, at 35.) William Baer's *Luis de Camões: Selected Sonnets, A Bilingual Edition* attempts to fulfill Vendler's request but with inconsistent success.

More than 400 sonnets have been attributed to the Camonian canon in one edition or another, though perhaps only 150 or so are now believed to be his. Baer has chosen to present seventy sonnets that "are generally undisputed, with three exceptions" (16). This excludes well-known sonnets such as *O raio cristalino s'estendia: Quem vê; Senhora, claro e manifesto; and Como fizeste, Pórcia, tal ferida?* all of which have been discussed in important articles dealing with Camões's art. Baer has arranged the poems he chose to translate in "no specific order" (17), and his minimal notes and commentary do not clarify the very vexed textual

arguments about c  
readers unfamiliar  
text.

Baer undertak  
sonnets, though he  
serving Camões's r  
aesthetic liberties"  
questionable result  
Camões's syntax, r  
*Amor é um fogo que*

*Mas como caus  
nos corações  
se tão contrário*

becomes

So how can I  
every captive  
is so contradi

Not only is the tra  
text and the notio  
that frames the be  
nance.

Another exar  
laments his belowe

Que modo tã  
para fugir ao  
permite que  
*debaixo de um*

as

How strange  
the world, to  
to hide her y  
beneath the

The translation of  
the literal substit  
obliterates the sha  
*beleza* and the bla  
may add historica  
but in doing so sa  
nun). Similar inst

Thus, while  
it is much harder

arguments about canonicity for an audience not versed in the controversy already. Thus, readers unfamiliar with Camonian material may find less apparatus than expected in Baer's text.

Baer undertakes the difficult poetic task of translating Camões's Petrarchan sonnets as sonnets, though he usually opts for Shakespearean rhyme schemes in the octave while preserving Camões's rhyme schemes in the sestet. As Baer writes, "Doing so has led to some aesthetic liberties" (17). This decision, while metrically honorable, often yields poetically questionable results, since meeting the demands of the form often requires that Baer sacrifice Camões's syntax, meaning, and emphasis to serve the rhyme scheme. Thus in the sonnet *Amor é um fogo que arde sem se ver*, the concluding triplet

*Mas como causar pode seu favor  
nos corações humanos amizade,  
se tão contrário a si é o mesmo Amor?*

becomes

So how can Love conform, without fail,  
every captive human heart, if Love itself  
is so contradictory in every possible way?

Not only is the translation questionable—the verb “conform” is not supported in Camões's text and the notion of *amizade* is lost altogether—but Camões's emphasis on *amor*, the noun that frames the beginning and end of his sonnet, is buried internally where it loses its resonance.

Another example comes in the sonnet *Que modo tão sutil da Natureza*, in which the poet laments his beloved's retreat from the world. Baer translates the first quatrain

*Que modo tão sutil da Natureza  
para fugir ao mundo e seus enganos,  
permite que se esconda, em tenros anos,  
debaixo de um burel tanta beleza!*

as

How strange is life that she should choose to shun  
the world, to run away from its deceit,  
to hide her youth and beauty, and to retreat  
beneath the cloak of a Franciscan nun!

The translation changes the focus from Nature's agency to the woman's, but more seriously, the literal substitution of “the cloak of a Franciscan nun” for *burel*, a beggar's cloak, totally obliterates the sharp contrasts in register and emotion with the Petrarchan diction of *tanta beleza* and the blazon of the lady's beauty that occupies the next quatrain. Baer's translation may add historical supposition (though his note to the poem only increases the confusion) but in doing so sacrifices the poetic heart of the sonnet for a more convenient rhyme (shun/nun). Similar instances of such losses can be found throughout the volume.

Thus, while it is good indeed to have a convenient version of so many texts available, it is much harder to use these translations to excite enthusiasm in readers for the artistry and

technical skill that are the hallmarks of Camões's poetry. While a few of the translations may well be considered excellent poems in English, and a number of others, including Baer's translation of Camões' most famous sonnet *Alma minha gentil*, are certainly competent, the body of sonnets presented as a whole are curiously devoid of the spirit of the originals: their compression, their balance, their frankness, and quite often their charm. As Frost said, "Poetry is what gets lost in translation." This is a beautifully produced and presented volume; one wishes that the translations it contains did better service to the original poems and their much underappreciated author.



**From Mother and Daughter: Poems, Dialogues, and Letters of Les Dames Des Roches.** Madeleine Des Roches and Catherine Des Roches. Ed. and trans. Anne R. Larsen. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2006. 288 pp. \$24.00. ISBN 978-0-226-72338-9.

REVIEWED BY: Kendall B. Tarte, Wake Forest University

For the editors of the excellent series *The Other Voice in Early Modern Europe* from the University of Chicago Press, beginning in the fourteenth century the "other voice" spoke out in protest against centuries of negative attitudes toward women, thus launching a critical reexamination of those accepted ideas and forging a new place for women. In the case of the mother and daughter Madeleine and Catherine Des Roches, that "other voice" spoke from Poitiers, France, during the 1570s and early 1580s. It claimed women's access to education, supported their right to choose not to marry, and defended their right to publish. The mother spoke with a personal voice, declaring love for her daughter and complaining of health and legal problems; she reacted with emotion to the horrors of the religious wars and in support of Catholics and of the king. The daughter's voice reciprocated that love for her mother; it offered models for young women writers and engaged in witty literary games with other poets. The Des Roches achieved fame during their lifetime as the hosts of humanist gatherings and as the authors of three books of poetry and prose (*Les Œuvres*, 1578; *Les Secondes Œuvres*, 1583; *Les Missives*, 1586). Scholars of sixteenth-century France are familiar with them, thanks in large part to Anne Larsen's editions of their works (1993, 1998, and 1999, respectively; all Geneva: Droz). In this welcome addition to the *Other Voice* series, Larsen's translation of selections from those books brings the Des Roches to an English-language audience of scholars, teachers, and students of the early modern period.

The book includes Larsen's introduction to the lives and works of Madeleine and Catherine Des Roches, a bibliography, and five chapters—each with its own brief introduction—of poetry and prose taken from the women's three publications: selections of Madeleine's poems from *Les Œuvres*; selected poems by Catherine from that work; poems by the mother and daughter from *Les Secondes Œuvres*; Catherine's complete dialogues (from both of those volumes); and examples of the women's letters from *Les Missives*. As in all volumes in the *Other Voice* series, editors Margaret L. King and Albert Rabil Jr. provide the material that frames the volume editor's text. The series editors' introduction, a description of the project that provides a framework for understanding the many works that have now appeared in that series, extended by a list of future titles, opens the volume; their bibliography of primary and secondary sources on early modern women closes it.

Adding to the long list of superb translations in the *Other Voice* series, this book will appeal to specialists and students alike. For readers new to the Des Roches, it offers a thorough—and thoroughly compelling—presentation of the mother-daughter pair. The intro-

duction covers the lives and difficulties they faced, the major themes of their work, and the current bibliography of discussion and analysis. Larsen's seventeenth-century observation is gracefully integrated into her portrait of the women.

Of course, the chapters, through their own writing, present works in verse the original only in English. One finds a rich, instructive material and the editor's selection of poems use endnotes, which gives a clear sense of the context and very readable, and t-

The poems in the first part of the book address distinct concerns of each woman; Catherine speaks for the woman writer. Some call it "poetry," and the poems in the second part of the book, as Larsen contextualizes them, are *Œuvres* illustrate the complex relationships with one particularly attractive of the Des Roches' work. The selection of letters demonstrates the letters by women. With another and to their context, those interested in the Des Roches' their unique literary er-

**Suspended Animation**  
Robert Mills. LO  
260-7.

REVIEWED BY

Suspended animation is a metaphor for the culture of violence in the early modern period. In this case referring to the theme of violence and death as a way to understand mutilation, and death. The growing list of recent responses to current critical theory, Steinberg and Carolin-